Accountability and Social Mission: New Winds in Health Professions Education

Fitzhugh Mullan, MD
George Washington University
School of Public Health
and Health Services

Richard and Janet Southby
Distinguished Lectureship
April 21, 2010
Health Professionals For A New Century: Transforming Education To Strengthen Health Systems In An Interdependent World

Julio Frenk*, Lincoln Chen*, Zulfiqar A Bhutta, Jordan Cohen, Nigel Crisp, Timothy Evans, Harvey Fineberg, Patricia Garcia, Yang Ke, Patrick Kelley, Barry Kistnasamy, Afaf Meleis, David Naylor, Ariel Pablos-Mendez, Srinath Reddy, Susan Scrimshaw, Jaime Sepulveda, David Serwadda, Huda Zurayk

The Lancet, December 4, 2010
Systems Framework
Vision For A New Era Of Professional Education

Transformative learning

Interdependence in education

Equity in health

Individuals
Patient-centred

Population
based
Recommendations of the US Institute of Medicine Report
The Future of Nursing

1. Remove scope-of-practice barriers
2. Expand opportunities for nurses to lead and diffuse collaborative improvement efforts
3. Implement nurse residency programs
4. Increase the proportion of nurses with a baccalaureate degree to 80 percent by 2020
5. Double the number of nurses with a doctorate by 2020
6. Ensure that nurses engage in lifelong learning
7. Prepare and enable nurses to lead change to advance health
8. Build an infrastructure for the collection and analysis of interprofessional health care workforce data
The Global Consensus on Social Accountability

A century after Flexner’s report on medical education in North America, the main challenge in the 21st century for the education of health professions resides in the demonstration by educational institutions of their greater contribution to improving health systems performance and people’s health status, not only by tailoring educational programs to priority health problems, but by a stronger involvement in anticipating health and human resources needs of a nation and in ensuring that graduates are employed where they are most needed delivering the most pressing services.
Transformative scale up of health professional education

An effort to increase the numbers of health professionals and to strengthen their impact on population health
WHO Definition

The transformative scale-up of health professional education aims to support and advance the performance of country health systems so as to meet the needs of individuals and populations in an equitable and efficient manner. Driven by population health needs, transformative scale-up is a process of education system and health system reform that addresses the quantity, quality and relevance of health professionals in order to increase access to health services and to improve population health outcomes.
The Sub-Saharan Medical School Study

The Sub-Saharan African Medical School Study
DATA, OBSERVATION, AND OPPORTUNITY
Medical schools in sub-Saharan Africa


Small numbers of graduates from few medical schools, and emigration of graduates to other countries, contribute to low physician presence in sub-Saharan Africa. The Sub-Saharan African Medical School Study examined the challenges, innovations, and emerging trends in medical education in the region. We identified 168 medical schools; of the 146 surveyed, 105 (72%) responded. Findings from the study showed that countries are prioritising medical education scale-up as part of health-system strengthening, and we identified many innovations in premedical preparation, team-based education, and creative use of scarce research support. The study also drew attention to ubiquitous faculty shortages in basic and clinical sciences, weak physical infrastructure, and little use of external accreditation. Patterns recorded include the growth of private medical schools, community-based education, and international partnerships, and the benefit of research for faculty development. Ten recommendations provide guidance for efforts to strengthen medical education in sub-Saharan Africa.
SAMSS Site Visited 10 Schools

Faculty of Medicine, University of Gezira
Faculty of Health Sciences, School of Medicine, Jimma University
College of Health Sciences, Makerere University
Hubert Kairuki Medical University
Faculte de Medecine de Pharmacie et d’Odonto – Stomatologie du Mali
UFR Sciences Medicales
College of Medicine, University of Ibadan
Faculty of Health Sciences, Walter Sisulu University
Faculty of Medicine, Catholic University of Mozambique
College of Medicine, University of Malawi
Recommendations

1) Grow Faculty Capacity
2) Build Medical Education Infrastructure
3) Support MOH-MOE Coordination
4) Fund Research
5) Promote Primary Care Education
Recommendations

6) Expand Graduate Medical Education
7) Align Medical Education with National Needs
8) Recognize Private Medical School Contributions
9) Expand Accreditation and Certification
10) Revitalize an African Medical Schools Association
## Table 1

### Themes Included in Each of 15 Reports Calling for Change in Medical Education*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Report</th>
<th>Year published</th>
<th>Integrating the educational continuum</th>
<th>Need for evaluation and research</th>
<th>New methods of financing</th>
<th>Importance of leadership</th>
<th>Emphasis on social accountability</th>
<th>Use of new technology in education and medical practice</th>
<th>Alignment with changes in health care delivery</th>
<th>Future directions in the health care workforce</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Ten Stories of Change³</td>
<td>2000</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Training Tomorrows Doctors⁴</td>
<td>2002</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AHCs: Leading Change¹³</td>
<td>2003</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reforming Medical Education⁵</td>
<td>2003</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Envisioning the Future⁸</td>
<td>2003</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vision for Medical Education⁹</td>
<td>2004</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UME-21¹⁰</td>
<td>2005</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Clinical Skills Curricula¹²</td>
<td>2005</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AMA ITME³</td>
<td>2007</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Revisiting Mission¹⁶</td>
<td>2009</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New Medical Schools¹¹</td>
<td>2009</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CME Redesign¹⁵</td>
<td>2009</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Future of Med Ed (FMEC)²</td>
<td>2010</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Primary Care Training¹²</td>
<td>2010</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A Call for Reform¹³</td>
<td>2010</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* One report was from Canada; the rest are from the United States. All were published in the last ten years. Superscripts refer to the citations of the reports in the reference list.
Social Mission of Medical Education: Ranking the Schools

The Social Mission of Medical Education: Ranking the Schools

Fitzhugh Mullan, MD; Candice Chen, MD, MPH; Stephen Petterson, PhD; Gretchen Kolsky, MPH, CHES; and Michael Spagnola, BA

Background: The basic purpose of medical schools is to educate physicians to care for the national population. Fulfilling this goal requires an adequate number of primary care physicians, adequate distribution of physicians to underserved areas, and a sufficient number of minority physicians in the workforce.

Objective: To develop a metric called the social mission score to evaluate medical school output in these 3 dimensions.

Design: Secondary analysis of data from the American Medical Association (AMA) Physician Masterfile and of data on race and ethnicity in medical schools from the Association of American Medical Colleges and the American Association of Colleges of Osteopathic Medicine.

Setting: U.S. medical schools.


Measurements: The percentage of graduates who practice primary care, work in health professional shortage areas, and are underrepresented minorities, combined into a composite social mission score.

Results: The contribution of medical schools to the social mission of medical education varied substantially. Three historically black colleges had the highest social mission rankings. Public and community-based medical schools had higher social mission scores than private and non-community-based schools. National Institutes of Health funding was inversely associated with social mission scores. Medical schools in the northeastern United States and in more urban areas were less likely to produce primary care physicians and physicians who practice in underserved areas.

Limitations: The AMA Physician Masterfile has limitations, including specialty self-designation by physicians, inconsistencies in reporting work addresses, and delays in information updates. The public good provided by medical schools may include contributions not reflected in the social mission score. The study was not designed to evaluate quality of care provided by medical school graduates.

Conclusion: Medical schools vary substantially in their contribution to the social mission of medical education. School rankings based on the social mission score differ from those that use research funding and subjective assessments of school reputation. These findings suggest that initiatives at the medical school level could increase the proportion of physicians who practice primary care, work in underserved areas, and are underrepresented minorities.

Primary Funding Source: Josiah Macy, Jr. Foundation.

Ann Intern Med. 2010;152:804-811. For author affiliations, see end of text.
Social Mission of Medical Schools

Definition

- % of graduates practicing primary care
- % of graduates practicing in underserved areas
- % of graduates who are underrepresented minorities
Findings

- The African American Schools (HBCUs) have high social mission rankings.

- Public schools graduate larger cohorts of primary care, underserved area, and minority physicians.

- The Northeastern US graduates relatively fewer primary care and underserved area physicians.
Findings

- Medical schools in less urban areas graduate relatively more primary care and underserved area physicians

- Six schools ranked in the first quartile of social mission and NIH funding
Message of Transformative Education

1) Social Accountability

2) Educational Reform
   - Information Technology
   - Team Learning
   - Accreditation
   - Professionalism

3) Policy Engagement
Recurrent Themes

- Premise of education – public good versus personal accomplishment?
- Dialogue between health and education policy makers
- Alignment between health science education and national health plans
- Location of graduates
- Interdisciplinary training and team based practice
Barriers to Transformation

- Momentum
- Money
- Tribalism
- Specialism
Conclusions

- Transformative movement exists
- Central tendency of themes
- Articulate spokespeople
- Excellent “road maps”
- Leadership Needed